How does market orientation affect church participation?  
An empirical examination

R. C. Mulyanegara*    Y. Tsarenko*

*Monash University

This conference paper was originally published as Mulyanegara, R. C. and Tsarenko, Y., How does market orientation affect church participation? An empirical examination, Sustainable Social Enterprise – International Nonprofit and Social Marketing Conference 2009, Victoria University, 14-15 July 2009.
How does market orientation affect church participation? An empirical examination

Dr. Riza Casidy Mulyanegara and Dr. Yelena Tsarenko, Monash University

Abstract

Over the recent years, the concept of market orientation has become an attractive avenue for research in marketing. However, despite an array of theories, a systematic framework investigating the role of market orientation in non-profit organizations remains limited. Through the integration of concepts from church participation and marketing literature, the study put forth a comprehensive model that describes the role of market orientation in church participation phenomenon. The study found support for the positive association between ‘perceived market orientation’ and respondents’ extent of participation in church-related activities.

Most studies in religious participation observed church participation as initiated by religious antecedents such as beliefs, motives, and valued outcomes, whereas a very limited number of empirical studies have been devoted to examine the role of market orientation in religious participation. The present study aims to contribute to the body of literature in non-profit marketing through an examination of the role of market orientation in encouraging participation. Whereas the term ‘religious participation’ is diverse in nature, the present study focuses on participation in Christian churches as the research context. Consequently, the term ‘church participation’ and ‘religious participation’ is used interchangeably in this article.

Theoretical Perspectives

Market Orientation

Deshpande and Webster (1989) define market orientation as an organisational culture that possesses a set of shared values and beliefs in prioritising the customers in strategic planning. Although still relatively few, there are an increasing number of studies that investigate the role of market orientation in non-profit organisations. A substantial number of studies have been devoted to examine the existence of market orientation (Graham, 1995; Mayfield and Crompton, 1995; Siu and Wilson, 1998; Van der Haart, 1990), antecedents to market orientation (Evans, James and Tomes, 1996; Hayden, 1992; Scrivens, 1987), and the relationship between market orientation and performance (Balabanis, Stables and Phillips, 1997; Bennett, 1998; Caruana, Ramaseshan and Ewing, 1998; Wood and Bhuian, 1993; Wrenn, 1996) in non-profit context.

While studies in the subject of market orientation usually involve employees as study participants, the present study examines market orientation from consumer perspective. The examination of market orientation from customer perspective, also known as Perceived Market Orientation (PMO), is still at its infancy in the literature (Krepapa, Berthon, Webb and Pitt, 2003; Steinman, Deshpande and Farley, 2000; Webb, Webster and Krepapa, 2000). This study aims to contribute to the body of knowledge in marketing literature through the application of PMO in non-profit context.
Market Orientation in the Church Sector

Church serves as an attractive research context for the examination of relationship between market orientation and consumer participation due to the important role of members’ participation in the production and delivery of church services. As the resemblance between the role of church members and consumers have been discussed in the literature (Santos and Mathews, 2001), this study proposes to contribute to the notion of consumer participation in marketing literature with church participation as the research context.

Although the introduction of the term ‘market orientation’ in church settings was proposed in the early 1990’s (Shawchuck, Kotler, Wrenn and Rath, 1992; Wrenn, 1993a), the root of marketing orientation in churches can be traced back to Martin Buber’s (1937) ‘I-You’ theological exposition. Buber (1937) argues that when we relate to others as objects (I-it), we see them in terms of what functions they can do for us, but when we relate to others as subjects (I-You), we see them as having feelings about the interaction as we do. Consequently, the I-You principle is considered the heart of market orientation (Stevens, Loudon, Wrenn and Cole, 2005, p.81; Wrenn, Shawchuck, Kotler and Rath, 1995, p.20), as nurturing church members via their relationship with the church leaders, other church members, and external publics is considered the primary objective of a marketing-oriented congregation.

Market Orientation and Church Participation

The relationship between market orientation and church participation has been conceptually proposed in the church marketing literature (Considine, 2001; Wrenn, et al., 1995). In an attempt to apply the notion of customer service in church settings, Wrenn (1993b) define ‘satisfied customers’ in church context as: “The members [who] want to continue to remain active participants in the church” (Wrenn, 1993b, p.252). The scholar emphasises the importance of satisfying church members as a matter of necessity and principle. In another study, the scholar pointed out that adopting market orientation is the key to delivering member’s satisfaction, as market-oriented churches always attempt to design services that are relevant to the needs, wants, and interests of existing and prospective church members (Wrenn, 1995).

Considine (2001, p.38) proposes the following link between market orientation and attendance commitment:

“if a marketing-oriented church is successful in identifying the spiritual and emotional needs of its members and then able to provide the types of programs and services that address these needs, then such a church should enjoy increased involvement and participation from its members”

The scholar added that successful implementation of market orientation can also result in more contribution from the church members in the forms of financial giving and volunteering activities (Considine, 2001). In a similar tone, Wrenn, et.al (1995, p.18) argue that “to the extent that their needs and interests are being served, the people will respond by making gifts of time, talent, money, and prayerful concern”. Although the arguments above have proposed a conceptual link between market orientation and church participation, there have not been any empirical studies devoted to support the link between the two constructs. In the light of these arguments, the following hypothesis is proposed:

Hypothesis 1: Market Orientation is positively associated with Church Participation
This study adopts the ‘component-wise’ approach (Han, Kim and Srivastava, 1998; Lukas and Ferrell, 2000) in which the market orientation construct is disaggregated into three distinct components to examine the significance of each dimension on the dependent variables. Consequently, the following hypotheses are proposed:

H1a: Customer Orientation is positively associated with participation
H1b: Competitor Orientation is positively associated with participation
H1c: Interfunctional Coordination is positively associated with participation

Methodology

Sample

In this research, the target populations are regular church goers (CG). The choice of respondents for this study was considered in relation to the knowledge required on the particular issues under examination. Since the self-administered questionnaire incorporates sections on people’s perception of the market orientation and brand orientation of the church, the respondents must have substantial exposure to church environment. 1085 questionnaires were distributed in thirteen churches that participate in the study. A total of 344 usable questionnaires were received from CG participants, giving a response rate of 31.7% which is considerably high given the absence of incentive.

Variable measurement

Market orientation

This study uses a modified version of Narver and Slater (1990) market orientation scale. Since this research examines market orientation from customer perspective, the wording needs to be modified to reflect customer perception. The modification procedure follow closely the recommendations of previous scholars on the application of market orientation scale in non-profit settings (Gainer and Padanyi, 2005; Padanyi and Gainer, 2004; Wood, Bhuian and Kiecker, 2000). The respondents were asked to rate the extent to which the church performs in three dimensions of market orientation ranging from not at all – to a great extent.

Church participation

For the purpose of this research, ‘church participation’ includes respondents’ participation in church-related activities other than Sunday Service such as cultural event, fundraising event, and social activities. The list of items listed in this section incorporates the different range of activities offered by the thirteen churches participate in this study. In this section, respondents were asked to score their level of participation in these activities over the past three months ranging from never to always.

Analysis and Results

Scale Validity and Reliability

Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) procedure is implemented to refine the constructs and to assess the convergent and discriminant validity of the constructs through an observation of the factor loadings. The reliability of constructs, on the other hand, was measured using internal
consistency formula in the form of Composite Reliability (C.R) (Fornell and Larcker, 1981). Both market orientation ($\alpha = .88$) and Church Participation ($\alpha = .85$) are found to possess excellent reliability level.

An assessment of measurement model fit is considered an essential step prior to the assessment of structural model (Hair, Black, Babin, Anderson and Tatham, 2006). The market orientation measurement model fits the data well as indicated in the fit measurement indices including Normed Chi-Square (NC) of 2.675, GFI (.959), AGFI (.923), RMSEA (.070), TLI (.947), NFI (.945), CFI (.964). The Normed Chi-Square of church participation measurement model exceeds the ideal level (5.703) but other fit indices including GFI (.983), AGFI (.916), RMSEA (.073), TLI (.914), NFI (.966), and CFI (.071) indicates good fit between the model and the data.

**Tests of Hypotheses**

\[ \text{Figure 1} \]

**Market Orientation – Church Participation Structural Model**

An examination of the fit indices suggests moderate fit between the model and the data. On one hand, the RMSEA (0.084) and TLI (.898) are outside the acceptable range and the Chi-Square was found to be statistically significant ($\chi^2 = 44.406$, df=13, p=.00). On the other hand, the Normed Chi-Square (3.416) is still within the acceptable range (<5). Other indicators such as GFI (.962), AGFI (.918), NFI (.914), and CFI (.937) are all above the recommended fit level. Another structural model is employed to test the corollary hypotheses.

The following model incorporates three dimensions of market orientation to determine which dimension performs the strongest effect on church participation. An examination of the GOF indices suggests that the model fits the data very well. Although the Chi-Square was found to be statistically significant ($\chi^2 = 139.736$, df=59, p=.00), the Normed Chi-Square (2.368) is within the recommended range. Other indicators including RMSEA (0.063), GFI (.936), AGFI (.902), TLI (.930), NFI (.913), and CFI (.947) are all above the recommended fit level.
Discussions and Conclusions

An examination of the standardised factor loadings and Critical Ratio in Figure 1 indicates that market orientation is positively associated with Church Participation ($\beta = .34$, $p < .001$). These results lend support to H1, suggesting that respondents’ perception of the market-orientation level of a church is positively associated with their extent of participation in church-related activities.

An observation of the sub-constructs in Figure 2 reveals that Interfunctional Coordination is the strongest determinant of Church Participation ($\beta = .24$, $p < .05$), lending support to H1c. Customer Orientation is also found to be positively associated with Church Participation ($\beta = .19$, $p < .05$), lending support to H1a. The results suggest that respondents’ perception of the church performance on these two dimensions is positively associated with their level of church participation. Regarding Competitor Orientation, the path coefficient is statistically significant ($\beta = -.18$, $p < .05$). However, the sign is reversed thereby failing to support H1b.

This study has contributed to the body of marketing literature through the application of Perceived Market Orientation construct to explain church participation phenomenon. As the literature of PMO is still at its infancy, there are future research opportunities for the application of PMO in other non-profit sectors and how it relates to other aspects of consumer behaviour relevant to the non-profit sector such as financial donation and volunteering. The present study also contributes to church participation literature through an investigation of the role of market orientation in encouraging church participation. Church leaders should embrace market orientation philosophy, particularly relating to customer orientation and interfunctional coordination, to enhance the participation of existing church members and attract prospective members.
References


