Observation of $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \gamma$ and Search for $X(3872) \rightarrow \psi' \gamma$ in $B$ Decays


(Belle Collaboration)

1 Budker Institute of Nuclear Physics, Novosibirsk
2 Faculty of Mathematics and Physics, Charles University, Prague
3 University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, Ohio 45221
4 Justus-Liebig-Universität Gießen, Gießen
5 Gyeongsang National University, Chinju
6 Hanyang University, Seoul
7 University of Hawaii, Honolulu, Hawaii 96822
8 High Energy Accelerator Research Organization (KEK), Tsukuba
9 Indian Institute of Technology Guwahati, Guwahati
10 Indian Institute of Technology Madras, Madras
11 Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana 47408
12 Institute of High Energy Physics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing
13 Institute of High Energy Physics, Vienna
14 Institute of High Energy Physics, Protvino
15 INFN–Sezione di Torino, Torino
16 Institute for Theoretical and Experimental Physics, Moscow
17 J. Stefan Institute, Ljubljana
18 Kanagawa University, Yokohama
19 Institut für Experimentelle Kernphysik, Karlsruher Institut für Technologie, Karlsruhe
20 Korea Institute of Science and Technology Information, Daejeon
21 Korea University, Seoul
22 Kyungpook National University, Taegu
23 École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), Lausanne
24 Faculty of Mathematics and Physics, University of Ljubljana, Ljubljana
25 University of Maribor, Maribor
26 Max-Planck-Institut für Physik, München
27 University of Melbourne, School of Physics, Victoria 3010
28 Nagoya University, Nagoya
29 Nara Women’s University, Nara
30 National Central University, Chung-li
31 Department of Physics, National Taiwan University, Taipei
32 J. Niewodniczanski Institute of Nuclear Physics, Krakow
33 Niigata Dental University, Niigata
34 Niigata University, Niigata

PRL 107, 091803 (2011) PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS week ending 26 AUGUST 2011

© 2011 American Physical Society

0031-9007/11/107(9)/091803(6) 091803-1
We report a study of $B \rightarrow (J/\psi \gamma)K$ and $B \rightarrow (\psi' \gamma)K$ decay modes using $772 \times 10^6$ $B\bar{B}$ events collected at the $Y(4S)$ resonance with the Belle detector at the KEKB energy-asymmetric $e^+e^-$ collider. We observe $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \gamma$ and report the first evidence for $X_{c2} \rightarrow J/\psi \gamma$ in $B \rightarrow (X_{c2} \gamma)K$ decays, while in a search for $X(3872) \rightarrow \psi' \gamma$ no significant signal is found. We measure the branching fractions, $\mathcal{B}(B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+) = (1.78^{+0.48}_{-0.44} \pm 0.12) \times 10^{-6}$, $\mathcal{B}(B^0 \rightarrow X_{c2}K^0) = (1.11^{+0.55}_{-0.34} \pm 0.09) \times 10^{-5}$, $\mathcal{B}(B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+) = (3.45 \pm 1.70) \times 10^{-6}$ (upper limit at 90% C.L.), and also provide upper limits for other searches.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.107.091803

PACS numbers: 12.60.Gy, 13.20.-r, 14.40.Nd

The $X(3872)$ state was observed by the Belle Collaboration [1] in 2003, and later confirmed by CDF [2], D0 [3], and BABAR [4] Collaborations. The fact that it was not seen in decays to $\chi_{c1} \gamma$, $\chi_{c2} \gamma$, and $J/\psi \eta$ final states suggests that the $X(3872)$ is not a conventional $q\bar{q}$ meson state that can be explained by a simple quark model [1,5,6]. Because of its narrow width and the proximity of its mass, 3871.5 $\pm$ 0.2 MeV/c$^2$ [7] to the $D^{*0}\bar{D}^0$ threshold, the $X(3872)$ is a good candidate for a $D^*D^*$ molecule [11]. Other possibilities have also been proposed for the $X(3872)$ state, such as tetraquark [12], $c\bar{c}g$ hybrid meson [13], and vector glueball models [14].

Radiative decays of the $X(3872)$ are important in understanding its nature. One such decay, $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \gamma$ [5,15], established its charge parity to be +1. In the molecular model, the radiative decays of the $X(3872)$ occur through vector meson dominance (VMD) and light quark annihilation (LQA) [11]. The decay rate of $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \gamma$ is dominated by VMD while for $X(3872) \rightarrow \psi' \gamma$ [16] it is mostly driven by LQA, implying that $X(3872)$ decay to $\psi' \gamma$ is highly suppressed compared to $J/\psi \gamma$ [11]. Recent results from the BABAR Collaboration [17] show that $\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow \psi' \gamma)$ is almost 3 times that of $\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \gamma)$, which is inconsistent with a pure $D^{*0}\bar{D}^0$ molecular model, and can be interpreted as indicating a $c\bar{c}D^{*0}\bar{D}^0$ admixture [11,18]. If the $X(3872)$ is an admixture of $\chi_{c1}$ and a molecular state, and its production and radiative decays are mainly due to its $\chi_{c1}$ component, then the $\psi' \gamma$ decay, a favored E1 transition of $\chi_{c1}$, should be significantly enhanced compared to the $J/\psi \gamma$ decay, which is “hindered” by poor wave function overlap [19].

In this Letter, we present new results on $B \rightarrow (\chi_{c1}, \chi_{c2}, X(3872))K$, where the $\chi_{c1}, \chi_{c2}$ decays to $J/\psi \gamma$ and the $X(3872)$ decays to $J/\psi \gamma$ or $\psi' \gamma$ [20]. These results are obtained from the final data sample of $772 \times 10^6$ $B\bar{B}$ events collected with the Belle detector [21] at the KEKB [22] energy-asymmetric $e^+e^-$ collider operating at the $Y(4S)$ resonance. The Belle detector is a large-solid-angle spectrometer which includes a silicon vertex detector, a 50-layer central drift chamber (CDC), an array of aerogel threshold Cherenkov counters (ACC), time-of-flight scintillation counters (TOF), and an electromagnetic calorimeter (ECL) comprising CsI(Tl) crystals located inside a superconducting solenoid coil that provides a 1.5 T magnetic field.

The $J/\psi$ meson is reconstructed in its decays to $\ell^+\ell^-$ ($\ell = e$ or $\mu$), and the $\psi'$ meson in its decays to $\ell^+\ell^-$ and $J/\psi \pi^+\pi^-$. In the $\psi' \rightarrow e^+e^-$ and $J/\psi \rightarrow e^+e^-$ decays, the four-momenta of all photons within 50 mrad of each of
the original $e^+$ or $e^-$ tracks are included in the invariant mass calculation (hereafter denoted as $M_{\ell^+\ell^-}(\gamma)$), in order to reduce the radiative tail. The reconstructed invariant mass of the $J/\psi$ candidates is required to satisfy $2.95 < M_{\ell^+\ell^-}(\gamma) < 3.13$ GeV/$c^2$ or $3.03 < M_{\mu^+\mu^-} < 3.13$ GeV/$c^2$. In the $\psi' \rightarrow \ell^+\ell^-$ reconstruction, the invariant mass is restricted to the range $3.65 < M_{\ell^+\ell^-}(\gamma) < 3.72$ GeV/$c^2$ or $3.65 < M_{\mu^+\mu^-} < 3.72$ GeV/$c^2$. To reconstruct $\psi' \rightarrow J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-$ decays, $\Delta M = M_{\ell^+\ell^-}\pi^- - M_{\ell^+\ell^-}$ should satisfy the condition $0.58 < \Delta M < 0.60$ GeV/$c^2$. In order to reduce the combinatorial background due to low-momentum pions, the invariant mass of the two pions from the $\psi'$ decay, $M_{\pi^+\pi^-}$, is required to be greater than 0.40 GeV/$c^2$. A mass- and vertex-constrained fit is performed to all the selected $J/\psi$ and $\psi'$ candidates to improve their momentum resolution.

The $X_{c1,2}$ and the $X(3872)$ candidates are formed by combining the $J/\psi$ candidates with a photon. Photons are reconstructed from clusters in the ECL and are required to have energies (in the lab frame) greater than 270 (470) MeV for $X_{c1,2}$ [X(3872)] reconstruction. In a similar fashion, X(3872) candidates decaying to $\psi'\gamma$ are reconstructed by combining $\psi'$ candidates with $\gamma$ candidates with energies greater than 100 MeV.

Charged tracks are identified as pion or kaon candidates using information from the CDC ($dE/dx$), TOF, and ACC systems. The kaon identification efficiency is 88%, while the probability of a pion misidentified as a kaon is 10%. The pions used in the reconstruction of the $\psi'$ in the $J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-$ channel have an identification efficiency of 99% with a kaon to pion misidentification probability of 2%. Candidate $K_S^0$ mesons are reconstructed by combining two oppositely charged tracks (with a pion mass assumed) with invariant mass lying between [0.482, 0.514] GeV/$c^2$; the selected candidates are required to satisfy the criteria given in detail in Ref. [23].

To reconstruct the $B$ candidates, each $J/\psi\gamma$ or $\psi'\gamma$ system is combined with a kaon candidate. Two kinematic variables are formed: the beam-constrained mass ($M_{bc} \equiv \sqrt{E_{beam}^2 - p_B^2}$) and the energy difference ($\Delta E \equiv E_B - E_{beam}$). Here $E_{beam}$ is the run-dependent beam energy, and $E_B$ and $p_B$ are the reconstructed energy and momentum, respectively, of the $B$ meson candidates in the $Y(4S)$ center-of-mass (c.m.) frame. Candidates having $M_{bc} > 5.27$ GeV/$c^2$ and lying within a $\Delta E$ window of $[-25, 30]$ MeV for the $X_{c1,2}$ and $[-30, 35]$ MeV ($[-20, 20]$ MeV) for X(3872) into $J/\psi\gamma(X(3872) \rightarrow \psi'\gamma)$ are retained for further analysis. We extract the signal yield by performing an unbinned extended maximum likelihood fit to the variable $M_{\ell\gamma\gamma}$ defined as $M_{\ell\gamma\gamma} = M_{\ell\ell} + m_\gamma$ [24] or $M_{\ell\ell\pi\pi\gamma} - M_{\ell\ell\pi\pi} + m_\gamma$, where $m_\phi$ or $m_{\psi'}$ is the world average mass [25]. In order to improve the resolution of $M_{\psi\gamma}$, we scale the energy of the $\gamma$ so that $\Delta E$ is equal to zero.

To suppress continuum background, events having a ratio of the second to zeroth Fox-Wolfram moments [26] $R_2 > 0.5$ are rejected. Large $B \rightarrow \psi X$ Monte Carlo (MC) samples (corresponding to 50 times the data sample size used in this analysis) are used to study the background. To study the non-$J/\psi$ (non-$\psi'$) background and $M_{bc}$ sidebands in data, within [2.5–2.6] GeV/$c^2$ ([3.35–3.45] GeV/$c^2$) and [3.2–3.5] GeV/$c^2$ ([3.8–4.0] GeV/$c^2$), are used.

For the $(J/\psi\gamma)K$ channels, the background is primarily from $B \rightarrow J/\psi K^*$ decays that do not peak in $M_{J/\psi\gamma}$. To reduce this background, we veto candidate photons from $\pi^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$ by combining them with any other photon and then by rejecting both $\gamma$’s in the pair if the $\pi^0$ likelihood is greater than 0.52. This likelihood is a function of the laboratory energy of the other photon, its polar angle, and the invariant mass of the two-photon system, and is determined using MC study [27]. We also reject photon candidates with $\cos\theta_{gel} > 0.76$ (0.85) in the $X_{c1,2}$ [X(3872)] selection, where the helicity angle $\theta_{gel}$ is defined as the angle between the direction of the photon and the direction opposite to the $B$ momentum in the $X_{c1,2}$ [X(3872)] rest frame. Applying these criteria, the background is reduced by 86% (79%) with a signal loss of 35% (30%) for the $B \rightarrow X_{c2}K$ [$B \rightarrow X(3872)K$] decay mode. For 1.3% of events with multiple candidates in $B \rightarrow (J/\psi\gamma)K$ decay modes, we select the $B$ candidate having $M_{bc}$ closest to the nominal $B$ mass [25].

A sum of two Gaussians is used to model the signal shapes of $B \rightarrow X_{c1}K$ and $B \rightarrow X_{c2}K$. The fraction of each Gaussian is fixed to the value obtained from MC simulated events. For $B^{+} \rightarrow X_{c1}K^{+}$ the other shape parameters are floated in the fit whereas for $B^{+} \rightarrow X_{c2}K^{+}$ they are fixed using the mass difference (from Ref. [25]) and the width difference (from MC simulations) between the $X_{c1}$ and $X_{c2}$. The nonpeaking combinatorial background component is modeled with a second-order polynomial. For the $B^{0} \rightarrow X_{c1}K_{S}^{0}$ and $B^{0} \rightarrow X_{c2}K_{S}^{0}$ decay modes, the signal shape is fixed using the results from the charged $B$ mode.

Figure 1 shows the fit to the $M_{J/\psi\gamma}$ distribution for $B \rightarrow X_{c1}K$ and $B \rightarrow X_{c2}K$ decays in the range of [3.38, 3.70] GeV/$c^2$. We observe the $X_{c1}$ in both $B$ decay modes, and obtain 3.6 standard deviation ($\sigma$) evidence for the $X_{c2}$ in the charged $B$ decay mode. The branching fractions obtained in both cases are consistent with previous measurements [17,28]. The statistical significance is defined as $\sqrt{-2 \ln (L_0 / L_{\text{max}})}$, where $L_{\text{max}}$ ($L_0$) denotes the likelihood value when the yield is allowed to vary (is set to zero). Uncertainties in the probability density function (PDF) (the mean difference and width ratio) are estimated along with other systematic uncertainties (described below) and all are included in the significance [29]. As no significant signal is found for $B^{+} \rightarrow X_{c2}K^{0}$, we determine a 90% C.L. upper limit (U.L.) on its branching fraction with a frequentist method that uses ensembles of pseudoexperiments. For a given signal yield, 10,000 sets of signal and
The significance of the combinatorial background component is modeled by a first two Gaussians is also used to model the signal PDF, and the ground component (blue dotted) as well as the overall fit (blue solid). The insets show a reduced range of $M_{J/\psi\gamma}$ and the contribution of the $B \rightarrow \chi_{c2}K$ peak.

background events are generated according to their PDFs, and fits are performed. The U.L. is determined from the fraction of samples that give a yield larger than that of data. For the $B \rightarrow X(3872)(\rightarrow J/\psi\gamma)K$ decay mode, a sum of two Gaussians is also used to model the signal PDF, and the combinatorial background component is modeled by a first-order polynomial. To take into account small differences between the MC simulation and the data, the signal PDF shapes are corrected for calibration factors determined from the $B^+ \rightarrow \chi_{c1}K^+$ fit. Figure 2 shows the fit to the $M_{J/\psi\gamma}$ distributions for $B \rightarrow X(3872)K$ performed in the range [3.7, 4.1] GeV/c^2. We find a clear signal for $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\gamma$ in the charged decay $B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+$ with a significance of 4.9σ and measure the product branching fraction $\mathcal{B}(B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+)\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\gamma) = \left[1.78^{+0.49}_{-0.40}\right]\times10^{-6}$. We also determine upper limits of $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\gamma$ consistent with previous results [5, 17]. We estimate the significance of the $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\gamma$ signal by simultaneously fitting the charged and the neutral $B$ decay modes; we obtain a significance of 5.5σ including systematics uncertainties.

For the $B \rightarrow (\psi'\gamma)K$ decay mode, the background has a broad peaking structure, most of which is from $B \rightarrow \psi'K^*$ decay mode. Here, since the $\gamma's$ from $X(3872) \rightarrow \psi'\gamma$ have low energy [less than one third of the energy of the $\gamma's$ coming from $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\gamma$], the $\pi^{3^0}$-veto and cosθ$_{had}$ selection result in more signal loss than background reduction. Instead, we combine the $\psi'K$ of the $\psi'\gamma K$ candidates with any $\pi^{\pm}$ or $\pi^0$ candidate in the event. Three variables, namely, $\Delta E'$ (≡ $E_{\psi'} + E_{K^*} - E_{beam}$), $M_{bc} = \sqrt{E_{beam}^2 - (p_{\psi'}^2 + p_{K^*}^2)}$, and the invariant mass of $K\pi$ ($M_{K\pi}$), are used for this purpose. Events satisfying the criteria of 817 $< M_{K\pi} < 967$ MeV/c^2, $\Delta E'$ within $[-20, 20]$ MeV and $M_{bc} > 5.27$ GeV/c^2, are identified as $B \rightarrow \psi'K^*$ candidates and discarded. This results in the reduction of the background by 59% with a 22% loss of signal. For 15.4% of events with multiple candidates in $B \rightarrow (\psi'\gamma)K$ decay modes, we select the $B$ candidate having $M_{bc}$ closest to the nominal $B$ mass [25].

The branching fraction for the $B \rightarrow (\psi'\gamma)K$ mode is determined from a simultaneous fit performed to the two decay modes of the $\psi'$. The background shape for $B \rightarrow (\psi'\gamma)K$ has both a peaking and a nonpeaking component. For the peaking component, the shape is estimated from a large sample of MC simulated events of $\psi'K$ and $\psi'K^*$, and their fractions are fixed using the branching fractions from Ref. [25]. The nonpeaking background (combinatorial background) is parametrized by a threshold function $(M_{\psi'\gamma})^2 \exp[a(M_{\psi'\gamma} - M_{th}) + b(M_{\psi'\gamma} - M_{th})^2]$, where $M_{th} = 3.725$ GeV/c^2. The $\psi'$ mass data sidebands and large $B \rightarrow \psi'X$ MC sample (after removing $B \rightarrow \psi'X$ and $B \rightarrow \psi'X^*$ decays) are used to estimate the parameters of the threshold function. The shapes for both background components are fixed whereas their yields are allowed to float in the fit. The signal is described as a sum of two Gaussians and is fixed from MC study after applying calibration corrections (obtained from a study of $B^+ \rightarrow \chi_{c1}K^+$ data) while its yield is allowed to vary in the fit. No significant bias is found in fitting ensembles of the simulated events containing the signal and background components.

Figure 3 shows the results of the fit to the $M_{\psi'\gamma}$ distribution for $B \rightarrow X(3872)K$. The fitted yields are 5.0$^{+11.9}_{-11.0}$ events (1.5$^{+4.8}_{-3.9}$ events) for $B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+ [B^0 \rightarrow X(3872)K^{0}]$. Since there is no significant signal in either channel, we determine upper limits of $\mathcal{B}(B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+)\times\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow \psi'\gamma) [\mathcal{B}(B^0 \rightarrow X(3872)K^0)\mathcal{B}(X(3872) \rightarrow \psi'\gamma)]$ as 3.45$\times10^{-6}$ (6.62$\times10^{-6}$) using the method.
described above. A completely independent analysis, with different selection criteria and a different fitting technique, was performed on the same data sample [30]; the results were found to be consistent with the results reported in this Letter.

The branching fractions and the fit results are summarized in Table I. Equal production of neutral and charged B meson pairs in the Y(4S) decay is assumed. Secondary branching fractions used to calculate B are taken from Ref. [25].

A correction for small differences in the signal detection efficiency calculated from the signal MC simulation and the data has been applied for the lepton (kaon or pion) identification requirement. Samples of J/ψ → ℓ+ℓ− and D∗+ → D0K+π+ decays are used to estimate the lepton identification correction and the kaon (pion) identification correction, respectively. The uncertainties on these corrections are included in the systematic error. The errors on the PDF shapes are obtained by varying all fixed parameters by ±1σ and taking the change in the yield as the systematic error. To estimate the uncertainty arising from the fixed fractions of B → ψ′K and B → ψ′K in the B → (ψ′γ)K background shape, we vary their branching fractions by ±1σ. The uncertainty due to the secondary branching fractions are similarly taken into account. The uncertainty on the tracking efficiency and the number of recorded B meson pairs are estimated to be 1.0% per track and 1.4%, respectively. The uncertainty on the photon identification is estimated to be 2.0% and 3.0% for B → (J/ψγ)K and B → (ψ′γ)K, respectively. There is some possible efficiency difference of the selections (Eγ, π0 veto, and cosθinel) between the data and the MC calculations. This difference in the B → (J/ψγ)K study is estimated to be 3.0% using the B → χc1K+ sample. Because of the nonavailability of a proper model to generate χc2 in the EVTGEN simulation [31], and the ambiguity in the allowed X(3872) JPC values (1++ or 2−+−) [32], we generate χc2 and X(3872) assuming them to be scalar, vector, and tensor particles. We find that 4.0% is the maximum possible difference in the efficiency and include it in the systematic error.

In summary, we observe X(3872) → J/ψγ in B decays and present the most precise measurement to date of the product branching fraction B(B+ → X(3872)K+)× B(X(3872) → J/ψγ) = (1.78±0.48±0.12)×10−6. We also report evidence for B → χc2K, and the ratio of B(B+ → χc2K+)/B(B+ → χc1K+) is measured to be (2.25±0.37±0.69 ± 0.17%). The measured branching fraction of B → χc2K is even more suppressed than expected compared to a recent theoretical prediction [33]. We find no evidence for X(3872) → ψ′γ and give an U.L. on its
branching fraction as well as the following limit $R(=R_{X(3872)}}/\psi') < 2.1$ (at 90% C.L.). The $X(3872)$ state may not have a large $c\bar{c}$ admixture with a $D^{*0}\bar{D}^{0}$ molecular component as was expected on the basis of the BABAR Collaboration result [17].

We thank the KEKB group for excellent operation of the accelerator, the KEK cryogenics group for efficient sole-
molecular component as was expected on the basis of the

[7] Our own average using the most recent measurements [X(3872) → J/ψππ decay channel] from Belle,
BABAR, CDF, and D0 Collaborations [3,8–10].
[16] The $\psi'$, which is sometimes designated as the $\psi(2S)$, is not a pure $S$-wave vector charmonium, rather it has a significant admixture of $J^{P}=1^{3}D_{1}$, $|\psi'\rangle=\cos\phi|2J^{P}S_{j}\rangle-\sin\phi|1^{3}D_{1}\rangle$.
[20] Hereafter charge-conjugate and neutral modes are included throughout the Letter unless stated otherwise.
[24] Here $\psi$ refers to $J/\psi$ or $\psi'$ and $\psi\gamma$ refers to $\chi_{c1}$, $\chi_{c2}$, $X(3872)$ depending upon the particle being reconstructed.
[30] The independent analysis uses a three-dimensional fit (M_{bc}, $\Delta E$, and $M_{\psi'\gamma}$) to extract the signal yield. The mass of the reconstructed $B$ (instead of $\Delta E$) is used to scale $E_{y}$ in order to improve the resolution of $M_{\psi'\gamma}$.